

Greater Glasgow NHS Board

Board Meeting
Tuesday, 26 July 2005

Board Paper No: 05/50

Chief Executive, NHS Greater Glasgow

**UPDATE ON CONSULTATION ON THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A WEST
OF SCOTLAND CARDIOTHORACIC CENTRE
AT GOLDEN JUBILEE NATIONAL HOSPITAL**

Recommendation

The NHS Board is asked to:

- **Note the key themes to have emerged from consultation on the proposal and the further programme of work to address outstanding issues**
- **Agree to consider outcome of consultation upon conclusion of this programme of work**

A. Background

At its meeting on 1st February 2005, the Board approved the launch of a consultation on the proposal to bring together Glasgow's cardiothoracic services, with planned interventional cardiology, together with thoracic services from Lanarkshire to establish a West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre at Golden Jubilee National Hospital.

Members will be aware from the previous Board paper (05/2) that under NHS Greater Glasgow's Acute Services Review, adult cardiac and thoracic surgical services, currently provided on two sites, are to be brought together on one site at Gartnavel General Hospital in 2012 at the earliest.

In October 2003, in order to address pressing workforce issues, clinicians and managers initiated discussions on the possibility of accelerating this move by some six years by establishing a West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre at Golden Jubilee National Hospital. The consultation document also introduced the concept of a more integrated cardiology and cardiac service, reflecting the pattern of clinical linkages and dependencies that have emerged since the original consultation - particularly between interventional cardiology and cardiac surgery.

The 12-week consultation exercise on this proposal concluded on 5th May 2005. This paper updates Board members on the key issues to have emerged from consultation and the programme of work being taken forward to address these issues.

B. Consultation Responses

The consultation process, which began on 10 February, attracted sixty-seven responses. Seven of these were received from members of the public, with staff and other interested parties submitting the remaining sixty responses. Appendix 1 details the range of mechanisms used to manage pre-consultation and consultation.

No clear clinical consensus emerged from the consultation; some believed there are advantages to the proposal while others were not supportive.

Whilst there was universal support for the creation of a single centre and the opportunities that this might bring to further develop the service, there were conflicting clinical views as to whether the Golden Jubilee National Hospital was an appropriate setting for this. Some acknowledged the modern accommodation available at the hospital however others questioned the availability of, and speed of access to, clinical support services that are essential for this specialised service.

There were also differences of clinical view on the proposed cardiology model, with particular concerns around the proposed separation of planned and emergency interventional cardiology.

Questions were also raised about staff related issues - in particular the proposed management arrangements - and about the funding associated with the establishment of a West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre at Golden Jubilee National Hospital.

C. Addressing the issues

A number of important and detailed issues have been raised through this consultation exercise. In order to be able to progress this proposal, we need to ensure that these issues are comprehensively worked through to a satisfactory conclusion with full engagement of all clinical staff.

Since the end of consultation, a series of meetings have been held with cardiologists, cardiothoracic surgeons and anaesthetists from throughout Glasgow and the West of Scotland. The focus for these discussions has been the clinical models proposed for West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre – in particular the cardiology model and the infrastructure that would be available at the Golden Jubilee to support a West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre. Separate discussions have also begun between NHS Greater Glasgow, Golden Jubilee National Hospital and NHS Lanarkshire to clarify the proposed management arrangements for the service. The following sections set out progress to date in these discussions.

(i) Links with other Services

In responding to the consultation exercise, clinicians emphasised the need for robust links with other services, including:

- A full range of laboratory medicine support, including histopathology and 24 hour cover for biochemistry, blood transfusion and haematology
- Access to specialist advice and support in general surgery, urology, vascular surgery, general medicine, respiratory medicine, renal medicine, neuro-medicine, diabetes, dermatology
- Imaging Services
- Medical cardiology, including nuclear cardiology
- Dedicated pharmacy service
- Allied Health Professionals including physiotherapy, dieticians and speech and language therapy
- Social work service

There was concern that the infrastructure at Golden Jubilee National Hospital is not currently adequate at present and that major reorganisation and investment would be required to provide the necessary support for a major cardiac surgery unit. It was also suggested that this might

further stretch existing services at base hospitals, although there was recognition that some of these clinical services already provide multi-site support.

It is important to stress that the proposed Centre would not be operating on a stand-alone basis at the Golden Jubilee. Currently, the Golden Jubilee runs elective programmes of surgery in a range of specialties, including elective cardiac surgery.

That being said, the current infrastructure at Golden Jubilee National Hospital is not adequate to support the clinical activity, complexity and volumes of cardiothoracic surgery undertaken in Glasgow and Lanarkshire and it was never envisaged that the present infrastructure at the hospital could meet the demands placed upon it by the proposed transfer of this service.

The consultation document began to address how appropriate clinical and laboratory services could be provided to ensure adequate support is available. It is evident however that clinical staff within NHS Greater Glasgow currently enjoy high levels of support from a range of services; therefore it is reasonable for them to seek reassurances that this could be adequately reproduced at the Golden Jubilee.

Since the end of consultation, further work has therefore been carried out to clarify the detail of the current level of support services that are accessed by the cardiothoracic surgeons and to define how these arrangements would be accessed if the West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre were established at the Golden Jubilee. The majority of consultant interface issues, i.e. clinical advice received from other specialties such as renal and general medicine, have been agreed. The remaining are in active dialogue and good progress is being made. Service requirements have also been clearly defined for laboratory and clinical support services that are required and potential options for providing them have been described. These are currently being assessed including possible financial implications.

(ii) Interventional Cardiology Model

The core issue of debate related to the scope of the proposed interventional cardiology service at Golden Jubilee National Hospital with disappointment expressed about the separation of planned procedural work from emergency interventional cardiology.

Work is now underway to re-visit this model to see whether an alternative interventional cardiology model can be developed which is clinically acceptable. This work is being taken forward with the full engagement of clinical staff within NHS Greater Glasgow and the West of Scotland.

(iii) Management Issues

The main staffing issue related to the operational management arrangements for the new centre. There was a suggestion that, as a regional service, the cardiothoracic service would benefit from being part of a wider regional health board arrangement. A number of staff also commented that management structures should be established well in advance of any move.

It has always been envisaged that a Partnership Board would be established, involving the three boards, to oversee the strategic direction of the West of Scotland Cardiothoracic Centre. This now needs to be progressed and defined in more detail.

On the operational management of the service, it is anticipated that a joint Clinical Implementation Group involving NHS Greater Glasgow, NHS Lanarkshire and Golden Jubilee would be put in place to manage the transfer of the service.

In order to clarify these issues, a meeting took place with representatives from NHS Greater Glasgow, NHS Lanarkshire and Golden Jubilee National Hospital to establish a way forward. Several pieces of work were sponsored from that meeting including further definition of the role and remit of the Partnership Board and the proposed introduction of a Clinical Implementation Group that would oversee the planning, transfer and final establishment of services at Golden Jubilee National Hospital.

(iv) Finance

A detailed analysis of capital and revenue costs associated with cardiothoracic element of the project is at an advanced stage. Work also needs to be carried out to assess the financial consequences of any revised interventional cardiology model that emerges following consultation. In these tasks, NHS Greater Glasgow is maintaining close liaison with the Scottish Executive Health Department and the West of Scotland Boards, as well as Golden Jubilee who are responsible for developing a full business case for the project.

We need to finalise the detailed financial analysis to ensure that the proposal - including the changes to the model of care being developed as a consequence of consultation - remains affordable.

D. Summary

Public response to this consultation was limited however the exercise was very helpful in testing the proposed clinical model with NHS staff. Whilst there has been acceptance of the benefits of bringing cardiothoracic services together onto one site, there was a lack of consensus for elements of the proposal.

A number of important pieces of work are therefore being taken forward to address these issues and these have been set out in the paper.

It is proposed that the outcome of these tasks be brought back to the September meeting of the Board for final consideration.

T A Divers
Chief Executive
0141 201 4641

Pre-consultation and Consultation Process

Working closely with project partners, NHS Lanarkshire and Golden Jubilee National Hospital, NHS Greater Glasgow managed the pre-consultation and consultation process through a wide range of mechanisms, including:

- Joint press release to launch feasibility study issued to all local and national media in October 2003
- Major engagement event on 12 July 2004 at which over 100 staff, patients and others with an interest in the service (including MSPs and the Local Health Council) toured existing facilities at Glasgow Royal Infirmary and Western Infirmary and proposed facilities at Golden Jubilee National Hospital before giving their views to help shape the proposal
- Circulation of engagement event report to all invitees in September 2004
- Joint press release to launch consultation on the day of the NHS Greater Glasgow Board meeting to all media on 1st February 2005
- Circulation of consultation document to engagement event invitees and to a wider audience of to patient support groups, interest groups, individual patients and members of the public on NHS Greater Glasgow's Involving People consultation mailing list in February 2005
- Circulation of consultation document to all staff directly affected by the proposed move and wider dissemination within Glasgow hospitals in February 2005
- Production of summary consultation leaflet for display in public areas in hospitals and health centres
- Public and staff meetings held in March and April to encourage discussion of the proposals
- Information was also made available through a number of different communication vehicles including the NHS Greater Glasgow web site, NHS Greater Glasgow Staff News and NHS Greater Glasgow Health News